

Asia Pacific Education Review (APER)

Education Research Institute (ERI)
Seoul National University, Seoul, Korea

Asia Pacific Education Review (APER) is installed as an internationally refereed journal, and aspires to attract and publish high scholarly quality articles and book reviews on education in the Asia-Pacific region. We cordially request your candid assessment of the quality and the publishability of the manuscript enclosed. It will be greatly appreciated if you fill out this confidential evaluation form and send to

Yong-Lin Moon, Editor of APER
Education Research Institute, Seoul National University
San 56-1, Sillim-dong, Kwanak-gu
Seoul 151-742, Republic of Korea
Tel: 82-2-880-5896, Fax: 82-2- 878-1665, E-mail: aper@snu.ac.kr

For your reference, we attached below short descriptions concerning the Purpose of the Journal, and the Editorial Board list at the end of this form.

- Your assessment is expected to return by: **March 18, 2008**
- Title of the Manuscript to be Reviewed: **#081009 Review of current studies in instructional design theory in Korea: Major trends and future directions**

* Due to the increase in the number of submitted articles and in the cost of publishing the journal three times a year, APER is no longer able to offer reviewers an honorarium. Your continuous professional contribution to the journal is greatly appreciated.

Name of Referee _____

Affiliation:

Position:

Phone number:

E-mail address:

Address:

Major research/review area:

Date _____

Signature _____

(If you send this by email, you don't need to sign here)

1. This manuscript is appropriate as an article ;

Yes
 No

2. If this manuscript is appropriate as an article, it is:

publishable as it is
 publishable if it is revised as indicated below
 not publishable for reasons indicated below

3. Comments and suggestions for revisions or reasons for not acceptance:

(In your assessment, please consider the aspects of each manuscript, such as the clear indication of the purpose of study, identification of problems and research issues, rationale including theoretical/empirical bases, methodological appropriateness, credible evidence or convincing scholarly claims, and academic and practical implications, etc. Please use additional sheets if needed):

Asia Pacific Education Review (APER)

Education Research Institute (ERI)

The introduction presents the purpose of the paper and the rationale for its significance in a clear and concise manner. This is a significant topic which can inform the work of researchers in instructional design.

The theoretical framework is adequately addressed, although the distinction between instructional theories and learning theories may not be clear to some readers. The author may wish to elaborate on why he/she considers Sweller's Cognitive Load Theory (CLT) to be a learning theory rather than an instructional theory. CLT builds upon descriptive theories of human cognitive architecture such as Bartlett's (1932, 1958) proposed schemas and Miller's (1956) research on working memory. Furthermore, CLT prescribes that instruction be designed to optimize the load on working memory by minimizing extraneous cognitive load. The author may wish to select as an example a theory that is more clearly a learning theory, and also select a specific instructional design theory for contrast.

The definition of "situation" (p. 4) is too similar to Reigeluth's and should either be an exact quote or reworded: "The *situation* here means those aspects of the context that influence selection of methods."

Reigeluth: "Therefore, I use the term 'situation' to refer to those aspects of the context that do influence selection of methods."

In describing the methodology for selecting and categorizing articles, it may be helpful to describe how the criteria were chosen. Were they determined *a priori* or did they emerge from an exploratory analysis? If the latter, are the categories comprehensive or are potentially useful categories missing because they weren't addressed by any articles in the literature review? Some categories are actually combinations of categories. For example, "Instructional design theory for types of learning" includes some articles that address cognitive domains (conceptual understanding, causal principles, critical thinking) and others that address instructional strategies (goal-based scenarios, problem-based learning, anchored instruction). Self-regulated learning seems separate from these.

Also, limiting the literature review to one particular journal simply because it was the first to publish on the subject in Korea seems like a weak argument. Are there currently any other peer-reviewed journals publishing relevant articles? If so, they should be included to provide a fuller picture of the trends in Korea and avoid potential misrepresentation.

The recommendations for future research are mostly consistent with the findings discussed in the paper and provide useful guidance for researchers.

In general there are problems with verb tense, with too much shifting from present perfect to past perfect to past tense.

Asia Pacific Education Review (APER)

Education Research Institute (ERI)
Seoul National University, Seoul, Korea

APER (Asia Pacific Education Review) is the journal which is being published biannually by the Education Research Institute at Seoul National University, South Korea. The institute was established in December of 1999 in order to educate specialists and scholars who can work for the development of Asian and Pacific education.

The main purpose of APER is to facilitate the exchange of disciplined inquiries of educational problems and issues and promote research and professional development among Asia-Pacific scholars, researchers, and educators. APER publishes theoretical and empirical papers, book reviews, and program development and applications pertinent to all areas of Asia-Pacific education.

APER (Asia Pacific Education Review) is the journal which is being published biannually by the Education Research Institute at Seoul National University, South Korea. APER is indexed and abstracted in SSCI(Social Science Citation Index) since 2005.

Editorial Board of Asia Pacific Education Review

Editor

Yong-lin Moon Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Psychology

Executive Editor

Jongho Shin Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Psychology

Associate Editors

Syed Farid Alatas Singapore, National University of Singapore, Sociology
Sun-Geun Baek Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Measurement & Evaluation
Mark Bray Hong Kong, Hong Kong University, Comparative Education
Harry Daniels USA, University of Florida, Counseling Psychology
Yong Hwan Jo Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Anthropology
Eunsun Joo Korea, Duksung Women's University, Counseling Psychology
Kyung Hi Kim Korea, Kyungnam University, Lifelong Education
Cheol Il Lim Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Technology
Jang-ho Park Korea, Kyungsoong University, Ethics
Bernard Spodek USA, Univ. of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, Early Childhood Education
Bruce. E. Wampold USA, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Counseling Psychology
Chang-Dai Kim Korea, Seoul National University, Counseling Psychology

Advisory Editors

Don Adams USA, University of Pittsburgh, Comparative Education
Bob Adamson UK, Liverpool Hope Univ., English Language Studies
Yash Bhagwanji USA, Florida Atlantic Univ., Teacher Education
Philip Altbach USA, Boston College, Comparative Education
Brian J. Caldwell Australia, University of Melbourne, Comparative Education & Leadership
Yin Cheong Cheng Hong Kong, Hong Kong Institute of Education, Education Leadership and School Quality
Punky P. Heppner USA, University of Missouri-Columbia, Counseling Psychology
Heribert Hinzen Germany, German Adult Education Association
John D. Hoge USA, University of Georgia, Social Science Education
Peter Jarvis UK, University of Surrey, Lifelong Education
Shuh-Ren Jin Taiwan, National Taiwan Normal University, Counseling Psychology
Ahnjung Kim Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Philosophy
Jae-Woong Kim Korea, Sogang University, Educational Policy and Administration
Dong Yul Lee Korea, Ewha Womans University, Counseling Psychology
Toshiyuki Mizukosh Japan, Kansai Univ., Educational Technology
Philip K. Piele USA, University of Oregon, Educational Administration
Charles M. Reigeluth USA, Indiana University-Bloomington, Educational Technology
Ilju Rha Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Technology
Tae Keon Rhee Korea, Inha University, Social Studies Education
Oon-Seng Tan Singapore, Nanyang Technological Univ., Psychological Studies
Mehmet Fatih Ta?ar Turkey, Gazi Univ., Science Education
Gene Roth USA, Northern Illinois University, HRD
Hsiu-Lan Tien Taiwan, National Taiwan Normal University, Counseling Psychology
Chung Il Yun Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Administration
Gay Garland Reed USA, University of Hawaii, Social Cultural Contexts of Education.
Roger Myers USA, Columbia University Teachers College, Counseling Psychology

Copy Editor

Anthony C. Banks UK, University of London, Law